



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
TERRI LYNN LAND, SECRETARY OF STATE  
DEPARTMENT OF STATE  
LANSING

July 13, 2005

**STAFF REVIEW OF INITIATIVE PETITION**

**SPONSOR:** Michigan Civil Rights Initiative Committee, P.O. Box 1398, Southgate, Michigan 48195

**DATE OF FILING:** January 6, 2005.

**NUMBER OF VALID SIGNATURES REQUIRED:** 317,757 signatures.

**TOTAL FILING:** 70,569 sheets containing 508,159 signatures.

**SIGNATURE SAMPLE**

**NOT INCLUDED IN SAMPLE:** 364 sheets; 2,189 signatures.

	<b><u>Sheets</u></b>	<b><u>Signatures</u></b>
Circulator certificate defective:	133	852
County of circulation entry defective:	108	158
All signatures on sheet defective:	10	9
Signatures dated more than 180 days prior to filing:	113	1,170
	<hr/> 364	<hr/> 2,189

**INCLUDED IN SAMPLE:** 70,205 sheets containing 505,970 signatures.

**SAMPLE SIZE:** 500 signatures.

**SAMPLE RESULT:** 450 valid signatures; 50 invalid signatures.

**Valid signatures**

Registered signers: 450

**Invalid signatures**

Facially defective signatures: 12

Signatures determined invalid due to signer's registration status: 38

**Total** 500

## **ANALYSIS OF SAMPLE RESULT**

- The signature validity standards employed by staff when sampling the petition were consistent with established law and current Board practices and policies; no new signature validity standards were employed.
- Forty-two (42) signatures identified in the challenge filed against the petition are among the 50 signatures determined invalid in the sample.
- The estimated number of valid signatures which appear on the petition as determined under the sampling process is 455,373. (See attached “Results from MCRI Petition.”) Based on the standard procedures traditionally employed to sample petitions, the sample data demonstrates that the petition is sufficient.

## **SUMMARY OF CHALLENGE DATA**

The challenge is unique as it heavily relies on the alleged “misrepresentation of the petition” by petition circulators while collecting signatures from Michigan voters. Misrepresentation of a petition has not been presented to the Board as the critical issue associated with the sufficiency of an initiative petition. The staff report reaches no conclusions on the legal authority of the Board to consider misrepresentation as a basis for finding petition signatures invalid. The following summary is the result of an analysis of the challenge documents and is intended to advise the Board on the categories of challenges that would have to be accepted in order to determine the petition invalid. A more detailed analysis follows the summary.

- A total of 325 signatures are identified in the challenge. After processing the challenge, staff identified 42 invalid signatures as referenced above and 88 challenges that are unacceptable. The reasons for determining the 88 challenges unacceptable are detailed in the accompanying documentation.
- The remaining 195 challenges involve issues related to the alleged “misrepresentation” of the petition and remain unresolved at this date.
- Had the sample revealed that the number of valid signatures was 297 or less, the petition would be insufficient. At least 153 of the 195 misrepresentation challenges would have to be accepted to render the petition insufficient.
- To reach the insufficiency threshold (i.e., an additional 153 invalid signatures) it would be necessary for the Board to determine invalid:
  - 3 signatures challenged on the basis of “misrepresentation” which are supported by a personalized statement;

- 32 signatures challenged on the basis of “misrepresentation” which are supported by a form statement executed by the signer;
- 10 signatures challenged on the basis of “misrepresentation” which are supported by a statement executed by the circulator;
- 36 signatures challenged on the basis of “misrepresentation” which are supported by a statement executed by a person who claims that he or she interviewed the signer by phone; and
- at least 72 signatures challenged by implication. The signatures challenged by implication are not supported by a statement executed by either the signer or the circulator. To reach 72 invalid signatures in this category, the Board must determine invalid:
  - 1) 38 signatures collected by circulators who *other signers* allege misrepresented the petition; and
  - 2) at least 34 signatures collected by circulators who are alleged to have misrepresented the petition according to persons who claim to have conducted phone interviews with *other signers* who interacted with the circulator.
- It merits observation that any determination that signatures challenged by “implication” are invalid would necessarily be premised on three assumptions 1) that the circulator misrepresented the petition to every signer he or she encountered 2) that every signer who interacted with the circulator did not understand the purpose of the petition and 3) that every individual who signed the petition at the request of the circulator would wish to have their signature determined invalid.

<p><b>KEY TO ACCOMPANYING CHALLENGE DOCUMENTATION AND “MISREPRESENTATION” CLAIMS</b></p>
--

- - - Challenge Status - - -				
Categories	Unresolved	Rejected	Overlap	Total
<b>A – Alleged misrepresentation of petition</b>	68	7	1	76
<b>C – Alleged deception: circulator statements</b>	4	0	0	4
<b>D – Invalid date</b>	0	0	2	2
<b>F – Alleged forgery or fraud</b>	0	6	0	6
<b>H – Alleged invalid or nonexistent address</b>	0	1	1	2
<b>I – Alleged illegible or incomplete information</b>	0	3	1	4
<b>R – Registration status challenges</b>	0	30	13	43
<b>Z – Alleged circulator deception</b>	90	29	6	125
<b>Signatures subjected to multiple challenges</b>	33	12	18	63
	195	88	42	325

**“MISREPRESENTATION” CLAIMS:** The signatures challenged on the basis of “misrepresentation” are reflected in the above chart as described below:

- In 3 instances, the voter drafted and executed a personalized statement which alleges misrepresentation (all 3 are included under category “A”).
- In 32 instances, the voter executed a form statement supplied by the petition opponents which alleges misrepresentation (29 are included under category “A”; 3 are included under “Multiple” – the last category on the chart).
- In 10 instances, the circulator who collected the signature executed a statement which alleges misrepresentation (4 are included under category “C”; 6 are included under “Multiple” – the

last category on the chart. In 3 cases, the signers also executed form statements; in 1 case, a person who claims to have interviewed the signer by phone executed a statement).

- in 36 instances, someone who claims to have interviewed the signer by phone executed a statement which alleges that the petition was misrepresented to the signer (all 36 are included under category “A”).
- In 114 instances, no statement was executed by the signer or the circulator. Instead, the signature was challenged because it was collected by a circulator alleged to have deceived other signers included in the sample (90 are included under category “Z”; 24 are included under “Multiple” – the last category on the chart). Of the 114 signatures challenged on this basis, 38 of the challenges are based on form statements executed by other signers; 73 of the challenges are based on statements executed by persons who claim to have interviewed other signers by phone; and 3 of the challenges are based on personalized statements executed by other signers.

RESULTS FROM MCRI PETITION  
 317757 VALID SIGNATURES REQUIRED  
 SAMPLE SIZE = 500  
 SIGNATURES SUBMITTED = 505970

NUMBER VALID	SHARE VALID	ESTIMATED VALID SIGS	PROBABILITY OF BEING CORRECT IF BOARD DECIDES TO CERTIFY	RECOMMENDED DECISION
500	1.000	505970	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
499	.998	504958	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
498	.996	503946	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
497	.994	502934	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
496	.992	501922	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
495	.990	500910	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
494	.988	499898	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
493	.986	498886	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
492	.984	497874	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
491	.982	496862	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
490	.980	495850	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
489	.978	494838	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
488	.976	493826	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
487	.974	492814	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
486	.972	491802	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
485	.970	490790	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
484	.968	489778	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
483	.966	488767	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
482	.964	487755	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
481	.962	486743	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
480	.960	485731	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
479	.958	484719	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
478	.956	483707	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
477	.954	482695	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
476	.952	481683	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
475	.950	480671	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
474	.948	479659	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
473	.946	478647	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
472	.944	477635	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
471	.942	476623	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
470	.940	475611	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
469	.938	474599	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
468	.936	473587	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
467	.934	472575	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
466	.932	471564	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
465	.930	470552	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
464	.928	469540	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
463	.926	468528	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
462	.924	467516	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
461	.922	466504	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
460	.920	465492	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
459	.918	464480	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
458	.916	463468	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
457	.914	462456	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY



456	.912	461444	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
455	.910	460432	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
454	.908	459420	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
453	.906	458408	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
452	.904	457396	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
451	.902	456384	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
450	.900	455373	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
449	.898	454361	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
448	.896	453349	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
447	.894	452337	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
446	.892	451325	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
445	.890	450313	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
444	.888	449301	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
443	.886	448289	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
442	.884	447277	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
441	.882	446265	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
440	.880	445253	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
439	.878	444241	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
438	.876	443229	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
437	.874	442217	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
436	.872	441205	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
435	.870	440193	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
434	.868	439181	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
433	.866	438170	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
432	.864	437158	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
431	.862	436146	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
430	.860	435134	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
429	.858	434122	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
428	.856	433110	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
427	.854	432098	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
426	.852	431086	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
425	.850	430074	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
424	.848	429062	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
423	.846	428050	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
422	.844	427038	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
421	.842	426026	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
420	.840	425014	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
419	.838	424002	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
418	.836	422990	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
417	.834	421978	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
416	.832	420967	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
415	.830	419955	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
414	.828	418943	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
413	.826	417931	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
412	.824	416919	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
411	.822	415907	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
410	.820	414895	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
409	.818	413883	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
408	.816	412871	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
407	.814	411859	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
406	.812	410847	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
405	.810	409835	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
404	.808	408823	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
403	.806	407811	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
402	.804	406799	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
401	.802	405787	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY
400	.800	404776	GREATER THAN 99.9%	CERTIFY

342	.684	346083	99.52%	CERTIFY
341	.682	345071	99.38%	CERTIFY
340	.680	344059	99.18%	CERTIFY
339	.678	343047	98.96%	CERTIFY
338	.676	342035	98.68%	CERTIFY
337	.674	341023	98.34%	CERTIFY
336	.672	340011	97.88%	CERTIFY
335	.670	338999	97.38%	CERTIFY
334	.668	337987	96.78%	CERTIFY
333	.666	336976	96.08%	CERTIFY
332	.664	335964	95.15%	CERTIFY
331	.662	334952	94.18%	CERTIFY
<hr/>				
330	.660	333940	93.06%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
329	.658	332928	91.77%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
328	.656	331916	90.15%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
327	.654	330904	88.49%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
326	.652	329892	86.65%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
325	.650	328880	84.61%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
324	.648	327868	82.12%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
323	.646	326856	79.67%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
322	.644	325844	77.04%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
321	.642	324832	74.22%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
320	.640	323820	70.88%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
319	.638	322808	67.72%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
318	.636	321796	64.43%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
317	.634	320784	61.03%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
316	.632	319773	57.14%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
315	.630	318761	53.59%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
314	.628	317749	50.00%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
313	.626	316737	46.81%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
312	.624	315725	42.86%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
311	.622	314713	39.36%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
310	.620	313701	35.94%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
309	.618	312689	32.64%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
308	.616	311677	29.12%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
307	.614	310665	26.11%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
306	.612	309653	23.27%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
305	.610	308641	20.61%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
304	.608	307629	17.88%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
303	.606	306617	15.62%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
302	.604	305605	13.57%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
301	.602	304593	11.70%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
300	.600	303582	9.85%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
299	.598	302570	8.38%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
298	.596	301558	7.08%	SAMPLE MORE SIG.
<hr/>				
297	.594	300546	5.94%	DENY CERTIF.
296	.592	299534	4.85%	DENY CERTIF.
295	.590	298522	4.01%	DENY CERTIF.
294	.588	297510	3.29%	DENY CERTIF.
293	.586	296498	2.68%	DENY CERTIF.
292	.584	295486	2.12%	DENY CERTIF.
291	.582	294474	1.70%	DENY CERTIF.
290	.580	293462	1.36%	DENY CERTIF.
289	.578	292450	1.07%	DENY CERTIF.
288	.576	291438	.82%	DENY CERTIF.



# Invalid signatures

<b>Total number of invalid signatures:</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>Signers who are not registered:</b>	<b>38</b>
<b>Signatures that are invalid on face:</b>	<b>12</b>
	<b>50</b>

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment
938	Josh Maenza	Not Registered	Challenged as 92704; Circulator not implicated
5057	Tyson Grzeskowiak	Not Registered	
6882	Jeremy Hobbs	Not Registered	
6976	Shantrell McKinnie	Not Registered	
7319	Andy Evans (?)	Not Registered	
8505	Stacy Byram	Not Registered	
8553	Elina Reznik	Not Registered	
8742	Keith Pardee	Not Registered	Not Challenged
9293	Whitney Rice	Not Registered	
11892	Greg Bowsher	Facially Invalid	Not Challenged - Address is not in Columbia Township
12750	Shad Spears	Not Registered	
14618	Zach Page	Not Registered	
16129	Andrea Grimshaw	Not Registered	
19946	Charles Tracy	Not Registered	Not Challenged
20914	Stevenson Duffie	Facially Invalid	Detroit voter listed city as Wayne
21252	Tyrone Rios	Not Registered	
22249	Delbert Black	Facially Invalid	No such address
22540	Dominic Adams	Not Registered	
22809	Robert Polak	Not Registered	
23777	Susan Harsh	Not Registered	
24002	Robert Brooks	Not Registered	
25251	Marmita Miller	Not Registered	
27098	Erica Walker	Not Registered	
30891	Jessica Mena	Facially Invalid	Not Challenged - Eaton County voter signed Ingham County sheet
30929	Ruth Zwick	Facially Invalid	Not Challenged - Livingston County voter signed Genesee County sheet
31216	Danny Patrick	Not Registered	
32573	Paula Campbell	Facially Invalid	
34253	Rhonda Bender (?)	Not Registered	
34671	Geneen Bradley	Not Registered	
34871	Carla McMorris	Not Registered	
35076	Diane Cutlip	Not Registered	
35841	David Radigan	Not Registered	
40314	Robert Linton	Not Registered	Not Challenged
42282	Laura Adams	Not Registered	
44075	Kenyatta Threlkeld	Not Registered	
50926	June E Rice	Facially Invalid	Clinton County resident signed Ingham County petition
51840	Tim Walters	Not Registered	
53942	Milissa Pancin (?)	Not Registered	
58294	Roger H Brown	Facially Invalid	Signature dated after circulator
60021	Helen Bristbane	Not Registered	
60461	Saguna?? Heller?	Not Registered	
61201	Leticia Herrera	Not Registered	
64331	Michael Wallace	Not Registered	Not Challenged
64340	Marcus Chapman	Facially Invalid	Not a valid address; surrounding buildings are commercial
66255	Daryousa Hosseini	Facially Invalid	Macomb County voter signed Genesee County petition
66895	Joe Mines	Not Registered	
67467	Chris Kennedy	Not Registered	Not Challenged
69172	Vondre Odoms	Not Registered	
69302	Charlene Isenhoff	Facially Invalid	Barry County voter signed Kent County petition
69367	Richard Babbitt(?)	Facially Invalid	Invalid Date

# A - Alleged misrepresentation of petition

Total number of signatures challenged under category "A":	76
Unresolved challenges:	68
29 Form statements signed by voter ("Voter-Form")	
36 Form statements signed by someone other than voter ("Other Person-Form")	
3 Personalized statements signed by voter ("Voter-Personalized")	
Statement not submitted for voter ("Challenge Rejected"):	7
Signature previously determined invalid ("Overlap"):	1
	<hr/> 76

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment	Pages
160	Patrick D Mills	Other Person-Form		A-1
2169	Donald Simmons	Voter-Personalized		A-2 - A-3
2889	Nicole McCoy	Voter-Form		A-4
3711	James K Korpusik	Other Person-Form		A-5
5412	Jewell Baltimore	Voter-Form		A-6
5553	Yolanda Sharpe	Voter-Form		A-7
6599	Cheryl Walker	Voter-Form		A-8
7771	Jason Hubbs	Other Person-Form		A-9
8170	Absalom Mueller	Other Person-Form		A-10
8432	Stephanie Burden	Other Person-Form		A-11
9298	Cleotha Morgan	Challenge Rejected	No affidavit received	
9378	Roderick McKnight	Voter-Form		A-12
9600	Cheryl Lynn Vincent	Voter-Form		A-13
9639	Dianne Carr	Other Person-Form		A-14
11538	Vickie Kosinski	Challenge Rejected	No affidavit received	
11729	James L Tock	Other Person-Form		A-15
13724	Margaret Grove	Challenge Rejected	No affidavit received	
14255	Dawn Hynes	Other Person-Form		A-16
18013	Alice Vaughn	Other Person-Form		A-17
18868	Samantha Sophia Canty	Voter-Personalized		A-18 - A-19
20372	Betty Henderson	Voter-Form		A-20
24594	Keitha Swift	Other Person-Form		A-21
24619	Yolanda Rene Rutland	Voter-Form		A-22
27362	James Alle	Other Person-Form		A-23
28020	April Jackson	Other Person-Form		A-24
28380	Nehemiah A Ward	Voter-Form		A-25
28854	Kenyada M Allen	Voter-Form		A-26
30560	Cheryl Thompson	Voter-Form		A-27
31159	Christine Shearer	Other Person-Form		A-28
31206	Vickie Kellar	Other Person-Form		A-29
32879	Toyoko Thaxton	Voter-Form		A-30
33664	Rachel L Crouch	Other Person-Form		A-31
34800	Robert W Pratt	Other Person-Form		A-32
34871	Carla McMorris	Overlap		A-33
35397	Kim Price	Other Person-Form		A-34
35406	Opal R Thacker	Other Person-Form		A-35
36055	Darlene Shepard	Other Person-Form		A-36
37416	Christie Darlene Fields	Voter-Form		A-37
38689	Rosevelt Briston	Voter-Form		A-38
40811	Jeanette Carlson	Other Person-Form		A-39
42858	Janice Kerti	Challenge Rejected	No affidavit received; Signature not in sample	
43957	Dianna Dean	Other Person-Form		A-40
44037	Thom Willard	Other Person-Form		A-41
44653	Latonia Thomas	Voter-Form		A-42
44690	Aywon Williams	Voter-Form		A-43

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment	Pages
44984	Lori Boulter	Challenge Rejected	No affidavit received	
45803	Rosa Blankenship	Other Person-Form		A-44
46534	John D Irving	Other Person-Form		A-45
48458	Lillian Cummings	Voter-Form		A-46
50262	Suzan Krupansky	Other Person-Form		A-47
50355	Mary Grace Johnson	Voter-Form		A-48
50372	Kim Dysinger	Other Person-Form		A-49
50446	Shirley Long	Other Person-Form		A-50
51448	Andra Williams	Voter-Form		A-51
52244	Carmaine L Hammel	Other Person-Form		A-52
52324	Carrie Brothers	Voter-Form		A-53
53576	Cathy McGhee	Voter-Form		A-54
53837	Oletric Virginia Robinson	Voter-Form		A-55
54341	Alfonso Davis	Voter-Personalized		A-56 - A-57
55104	Bianca Jeannette Williams	Voter-Form		A-58
55612	Betty Nicholls	Other Person-Form		A-59
56297	Evelyn Carol Ewing	Challenge Rejected	No affidavit received	
56598	Timothy Myers	Challenge Rejected	No affidavit received	
57107	Willie Fryer	Voter-Form		A-60
57121	Elaine Yopp	Voter-Form		A-61
57211	Sandra Weston	Other Person-Form		A-62
59642	Kelly Ryan	Other Person-Form		A-63
60521	Debra Brecht	Other Person-Form		A-64
62247	Sam Figueroa	Other Person-Form		A-65
63202	Alicai Rose Spencer	Voter-Form		A-66
63218	Victoria Willis	Voter-Form		A-67
65211	James A Ebelt	Other Person-Form		A-68
65301	Earline Loyd	Voter-Form		A-69
66843	Veretta Coleman	Voter-Form		A-70
68468	Linda Ward	Other Person-Form		A-71
70075	Connie Whipple Nelson	Other Person-Form		A-72

## C - Alleged deception: circulator statements

Total number of signatures challenged under category "I":	4
Unresolved challenge:	<u>4</u>
	4

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment	Pages
8604	Nickisha York	Unresolved	Circulated by Exie Chester-Griffen	C-1
10738	Richard Brown	Unresolved	Circulated by Exie Chester-Griffen	C-1
11101	Drucilla Smoot	Unresolved	Circulated by Exie Chester-Griffen	C-1
40941	Donna Simonson	Unresolved	Circulated by Laura Cross	C-2

## D - Invalid date

Total number of signatures challenged under category "D":	2
Signature previously determined invalid ("Overlap"):	<u>2</u>
	2

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment
58294	Roger H Brown	Overlap	Signature dated after circulator
69367	Richard Babbitt(?)	Overlap	Invalid Date



## F - Alleged forgery or fraud

Total number of signatures challenged under category "F":	6
Rejected challenge:	<u>6</u>
	6

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment	Pages
219	Leslie Warren	Challenge Rejected	Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate	F-1
13796	Bobbie Davis	Challenge Rejected	Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate	F-2
17671	Jason Ashak	Challenge Rejected	Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate	F-3
32838	Nancy L Yonker	Challenge Rejected	Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate	F-4
47270	Donna L Faison	Challenge Rejected	Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate	F-5
50533	Ruby Mitchell	Challenge Rejected	Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate	F-6

## H - Alleged invalid or nonexistent address

Total number of signatures challenged under category "H":	2
Rejected challenge:	1
Signature previously determined invalid ("Overlap"):	<u>1</u>
	2

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment	Pages
42970	Gloria Vasser	Challenge Rejected	Challenged as "1 Chawcross Pl." actually "1 Sha	H-1 - H-2
66255	Daryousa Hosseini	Overlap	Macomb County voter signed Genesee County p	H-3



## I - Alleged illegible or incomplete information

Total number of signatures challenged under category "I":	4
Rejected challenge:	3
Signature previously determined invalid ("Overlap"):	<u>1</u>
	4

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment	Pages
9597	Stanley Delisle	Challenge Rejected		I-1
12533	Jon B Rogers	Challenge Rejected		I-2
13517	Frank S Suhy	Challenge Rejected		I-3
14618	Zach Page	Overlap		I-4

## R - Registration status challenges

Total number of signatures challenged under category "R":	43
Registered voters:	30
Signature previously determined invalid ("Overlap"):	13
	43

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment	Pages
1505	Tanya Ghering	Registered		R-1
3381	Gregory Miles	Registered		R-2 - R-3
3759	Jana Lynema	Registered		R-4 - R-5
4067	G Molnar (?)	Registered		R-6 - R-7
6882	Jeremy Hobbs	Overlap		
9971	Mark E Odon	Registered		R-8
16495	Helen Plaunt	Registered		R-9
17466	Tyrone Reed	Registered		R-10 - R-11
17620	Stacy A Mueller	Registered		R-12 - R-13
20018	M John Oneill	Registered		R-14
21252	Tyrone Rios	Overlap		
24002	Robert Brooks	Overlap		
25047	Toney Stackhouse	Registered		R-15 - R-16
26241	George L Davis	Registered		R-17
26690	George Govin (Covin?)	Registered		R-18
31216	Danny Patrick	Overlap		
31840	William Whitlow	Registered		R-19
32148	Steve Rousseau	Registered		R-20 - R-21
34253	Rhonda Bender (?)	Overlap		R-22
34671	Geneen Bradley	Overlap		
35076	Diane Cutlip	Overlap		
36812	Joseph Stankula	Registered		R-23
38015	Robin Lucas	Registered		R-24
38210	Kelly Johnson	Registered		R-25
42282	Laura Adams	Overlap		
42519	Susan Griffin	Registered		R-26 - R-27
44075	Kenyatta Threlkeld	Overlap		
47478	Cheryl West	Registered		R-28 - R-29
50070	Crathian Braxton	Registered		R-30 - R-31
50926	June E Rice	Overlap	Clinton County resident signed Ingham County pe	R-32
51840	Tim Walters	Overlap		
53329	Frank R Zvonar	Registered	Deceased after signing petition	R-33 - R-34
55911	Ben Johnson	Registered		R-35 - R-36
58923	Gazzala Aslam	Registered		R-37
60395	Heather Bozik	Registered		R-38 - R-39
60982	Eddie Armour	Registered		R-40
61201	Leticia Herrera	Overlap		R-41
64264	Norman Benjamin	Registered		R-42 - R-43
64388	Patricia Poloms?	Registered		R-44
66895	Joe Mines	Overlap		
68183	Damaree Knight	Registered		R-45 - R-46
68367	Roger Martin	Registered		R-47
68969	Joanne Miller	Registered		R-48

## Z - Alleged circulator deception

**NOTE: No statements submitted by signers or circulators. Signatures challenged under category "Z" represent other signatures in sample collected by circulators alleged to have deceived signers under category "A."**

<b>Total number of signatures challenged under category "Z":</b>	<b>125</b>
<b>Unresolved challenges:</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>25 Form statements signed by voter ("Voter-Form")</b>	
<b>63 Form statements signed by someone other than voter ("Other Person-Form")</b>	
<b>2 Personalized statements signed by voter ("Voter-Personalized")</b>	
<b>Circulator not implicated under category "A" ("Challenge Rejected"):</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>Signature previously determined invalid ("Overlap"):</b>	<b>6</b>
	<hr/> <b>125</b>

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment
371	Thomas A Schmidt	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
477	Dorothy Pulliam	Unresolved	Voter-Form
1286	Roger Harper	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
2280	Mark Gansmiller	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
2856	Nicole E Whitt	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
2952	Vencenta E Brooks	Unresolved	Voter-Form
2984	Clifford Bellant	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
4757	Debra L Paytas	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
5850	Donald Badacrewski	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
5854	Darlene M Jezewski	Unresolved	Voter-Form
5935	Daryl L Larke	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
6005	Dorothy Dekutoski	Unresolved	Voter-Form
6222	Cecil Magnus	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
7602	Heather Buhlman	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
7914	Christine L Butcher	Unresolved	Voter-Form
8054	Joseph Painter	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
8505	Stacy Byram	Overlap	Voter-Personalized
8553	Elina Reznik	Overlap	Other Person-Form
9293	Whitney Rice	Overlap	Voter-Form
9802	Cara Ontiveros	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
9983	Sandra Rubenstein	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
10003	Richard Miles II	Unresolved	Voter-Form
10281	Deborah A Hale	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
10978	Jean E Dinkel	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
11710	Cherese Pittman	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
12087	Frank Pascoe	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
13026	Nelly M Heitman	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
16092	Christina Daniels	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
16259	Olga V Sucevan	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
16429	Lori Kogelman	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
17531	Carmelina Frusciano	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
17653	Shelly McCown	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
17780	Kilea Marshall	Unresolved	Voter-Form
17901	Dawn Loftus	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
19921	Sarah Gruber	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
20140	Lisa Youd	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
20914	Stevenson Duffie	Overlap	Voter-Form; Detroit voter listed city as Wayne
22186	Erick Hill	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
22315	Keith Peterson	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
23777	Susan Harsh	Overlap	Voter-Form
23862	Janice O'Dell	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
23890	Lora Fezatte	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment
24621	Elaine (?) J Renollet	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
24778	Joanne Miller	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
25572	Florence Daly	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
26375	Reid C Travis	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
26633	Dennis A Rogers	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
30843	Pamela P Farber	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
32058	John Adamczyk	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
33066	Anna Kroczaleski	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
35183	Joann Linhardt	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
36121	Barb Brockett	Unresolved	Voter-Form
36437	Carol A Forbes	Unresolved	Voter-Form
36852	Dawn Poliskie	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
37330	Christy Jenuwine	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
37333	Duane Jasper	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
37343	Judy Thompson	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
37696	Elaine Wirta	Unresolved	Voter-Form
38176	Lakita Spain	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
38340	John H Farrand	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
38681	Filippa C Casey	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
38839	Regina Piernick	Unresolved	Voter-Form
39004	Angela Viviano	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
40787	Rodney Wurst	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
41092	Martin Gawronski	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
41171	Susan A Dunn	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
41757	Tynia Daniels	Unresolved	Voter-Form
42335	Kristin Wade	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
42898	Marilyn Fistler	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
43023	Valerie Doka-Niznak	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
43279	Carolyn Elston	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
43418	Marlon Southall	Unresolved	Voter-Form
43454	Barbara Davis	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
43491	Olivia Corcoran	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
43873	Susan Foreman	Unresolved	Voter-Personalized
44983	Tenia Dossett	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
45481	James E Coffman	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
45639	Skye Hughes	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
46701	Eman Hassan	Unresolved	Voter-Form
46829	Helen Whitehead	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
47142	Marilyn Claseman	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
47819	Joanne M Kastle	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
48103	Thomas J Bartus	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
48372	Dawn Pokotello	Unresolved	Voter-Form
50501	Nicole Ruff	Unresolved	Voter-Form
50901	Virginia Pellerito	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
51045	Ricky Betts	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
51355	Carol Nelson	Unresolved	Voter-Personalized
52958	Amy C George	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
54111	Tracy Dean	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
54768	Shirley Wilson	Unresolved	Voter-Form
54799	Patricia A Lutz	Unresolved	Voter-Form
56083	Leon W Delange	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
56209	Janiece Guzowski	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
56441	Dan J Moore	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
56556	Linda Piper	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
56879	Bennie Shellnut	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
56997	Robert C Hall	Unresolved	Voter-Form
57335	Sheri Wagner	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
57886	Richard Wetmore	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
57891	Rob Dancer	Unresolved	Other Person-Form

Sheet	Name	Status	Comment
57976	James Krejcik	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
59676	Sheila Edwards	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
59700	Ronald W Hunter	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
59736	Tracey Kolassa	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
60340	Stef Fincham	Unresolved	Voter-Form
61159	Jeffrey Bauer	Unresolved	Voter-Form
61268	Evonne Gustas	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
61647	Brandy Bailey	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
63135	Carolyn Curtis	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
63290	Wendy Beaver	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
64437	C Smith Iannazzo	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
64595	Robert Bottinelli	Unresolved	Voter-Form
64653	Carole Young	Unresolved	Voter-Form
66975	David M Graef	Unresolved	Voter-Form
67014	James Hartmeyer	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
67650	Nicholas Toren	Challenge Rejected	Circulator not implicated
68448	Christopher E Gierula	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
68569	Barry G Allen	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
68654	Melvin Wernly (?)	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
68687	Steven MacLean	Unresolved	Voter-Form
69055	Laura Sawyer	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
69297	Kathaleen Hinkle	Unresolved	Other Person-Form
69302	Charlene Isenhoff	Overlap	Other Person-Form; Barry County voter signed Kent County petition
69845	Kim Mullins	Unresolved	Other Person-Form

# Signatures subjected to multiple challenges

<b>Total number of signatures challenged:</b>	<b>63</b>
<b>Unresolved challenges:</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>Challenge Rejected:</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Signature previously determined invalid ("Overlap"):</b>	<b>18</b>
	<b>63</b>

Sheet	Name	Challenges	Status	Comment	Pages
499	Jaqueline Rie (?)	R; I	Rejected Challenge	Registered	Multp-1 - Multp-3
938	Josh Maenza	Z; R	Overlap	Challenged as 92704; Circulator not implicated	
1854	Betty Clevenger	Z; R	Rejected Challenge	Registered; Circulator not implicated	Multp-4
3401	Brian Fitzgerald	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-5 - Multp-6
3549	Charles R Lawson (?)	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-7
3900	Renitta Bowers	A; C; R	Unresolved	A-Voter-Form; Registered; Circulated by Lerwonina Summers	Multp-8 - Multp-10
4753	Terra Clark	A; Z; R	Unresolved	A-Voter-Form; Z-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-11 - Multp-13
5057	Tyson Grzeskowiak	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Voter-Form	Multp-14 - Multp-16
5703	Lexie King	A; C	Unresolved	A-Other Person-Form; Circulated by Sammy Williams	
6976	Shantrell McKinnie	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Voter-Form	Multp-17 - Multp-18
7319	Andy Evans (?)	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Other Person-Form	
8585	John Ireland	A; C	Unresolved	A-Voter-Form; Circulated by Exie Chester-Griffen	Multp-19 - Multp-20
8592	Rasheda Chatman	A; C	Unresolved	A-Voter-Form; Circulated by Exie Chester-Griffen	Multp-20 - Multp-24
8643	Matthew Brantley	C; H	Unresolved	Circulated by Exie Chester-Griffen; 3rd party affidavit concerning address; multiple units in building	Multp-25
9957	Joyce Jutczak (?)	Z; R	Rejected Challenge	Registered; Circulator not implicated	Multp-26 - Multp-28
11013	Alphonso Curn (?)	R; I	Rejected Challenge	Registered	Multp-29
11134	Jason Beckwith	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Registered	Multp-30
11224	Deke A Hurlson	Z; I	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form	Multp-31 - Multp-32
12046	Gracie M Harris	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-33
12750	Shad Spears	R; I	Overlap		Multp-34 - Multp-37
14337	Gregory Adams	R; H	Rejected Challenge	Registered	Multp-38 - Multp-40
15581	Anitria Patterson	Z; I; H	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; 3rd party affidavit concerning address	Multp-41 - Multp-43
16112	Judy Miller	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Registered	Multp-44 - Multp-45
16129	Andrea Grimshaw	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Other Person-Form	Multp-46 - Multp-48
20607	Joe Dudose (???)	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-49 - Multp-53
20645	Charlene Thomas	C; H	Unresolved	Circulated by Exie Chester-Griffen; Challenged as "1161 Rossiter" actually "1161 Rossiter"	Multp-54
22249	Delbert Black	Z; R; H	Overlap	Z-Voter-Personalized; No such address	Multp-55 - Multp-57
22540	Dominic Adams	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Voter-Form	Multp-58 - Multp-61
22809	Robert Polak	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Other Person-Form	
25251	Marmita Miller	A; Z; R	Overlap	A-Voter-Form; Z-Voter-Personalized	
25368	Opal Thomson	Z; D	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Date OK	
26826	Walter Mieczkowski	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	
27098	Erica Walker	R; H	Overlap		

Sheet	Name	Challenges	Status	Comment	Pages
27925	Dorothy Jamison	A; R	Unresolved	A-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-62 - Multp-64
30516	Steve Amstead	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Registered; Challenged as 31516; Actually Steven Olmstead	
32573	Paula Campbell	R; H	Overlap		Multp-66
33064	Michael Lyons	A; R	Rejected Challenge	Registered; Not in sample	
33264	Jeffrey E Ely	Z; R	Rejected Challenge	Registered; Circulator not implicated	Multp-67 - Multp-68
35841	David Radigan	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Other Person-Form	
36012	Nancy Fortelka	Z; F	Rejected Challenge	Circulator not implicated; allegedly forged signature, signature matches registration	Multp-69
39517	Judith Deans (??)	R; H	Rejected Challenge	Registered; Challenged as "8135 Giydale" actually "8135 Grixdale"	
41537	Keena Richard	Z; F	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate signature	Multp-73
42337	Mattie Wilson	I; H	Rejected Challenge	No affidavit challenging this signature	
43389	Virginia E Thompson	Z; I	Rejected Challenge	Challenged as 44389; Circulator not implicated; challenge due to incorrect ZIP Code, does not invalidate signature	Multp-74
44534	Clarissa Pickett	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	
45463	Ervin Jackson	A; R	Unresolved	A-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-75
51331	Thomas Walker	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	
53575	Raymond Dann	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-76 - Multp-78
53942	Milissa Pancin (?)	Z; R	Overlap	Z-Other Person-Form	
54235	Alicia Ross	Z; F	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate signature	Multp-79 - Multp-80
58283	Donovan K Thom	Z; F	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate signature	
59333	Suzanne Rybinski	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Form; Registered	Multp-81 - Multp-82
59646	Frank French	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Registered	
60021	Helen Bristbane	R; H	Overlap		Multp-83
60461	Saguna?? Heller?	Z; R; H	Overlap	Z-Voter-Form	
62072	Betty Beck	Z; F	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Date in different handwriting, does not invalidate signature	Multp-84
62235	Tamila Walker	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Registered	
64340	Marcus Chapman	R; H	Overlap	Not a valid address; surrounding buildings are commercial	Multp-85
64613	Kennedy Holden	Z; H	Unresolved	Z-Voter-Personalized; Challenged as "6876 Webb" actually "6376 Webb"	
67545	Donald F Miller	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Registered	Multp-86
69172	Vondre Odoms	A; R	Overlap	A-Voter-Form	
69621	Murrill Colburn	Z; R	Unresolved	Z-Other Person-Form; Registered	Multp-87 - Multp-88
70108	Shirley Davis	R; H	Rejected Challenge	Registered; Address is 24 hour walk-in center for homeless	